

Fundamentals of Marketing & Paradigm Shift: 9th P's Implications for the 21st Century Marketing Mix and for Social Marketing. Conceptual and literature development paper

Ebikinei Stanley Eguruze^{PhD}, Gaitri Kumari,^{PhD}, Mona Ratnesh,^{PhD},
Dr Benneth Nwafor,^{PhD}

ABSTRACT:- Marketing mix is the fundamentals of marketing, which presently consists of 7P's. Over time, the mix had evolved from the 4P's status around about 1948/9 in relation to goods. Subsequently, this was formalised in 1961. Later, three more variables emerged in relation to services, which were added to the mix to become 7P's in 1981. In an increasingly globalised, dynamic, competitive, innovative and technology based 21st century business environment, it has now made it necessary to consider adding the 9th P's mix elements, which is the Platform of the internet. In fact, there is yet a similar theorization with respect to the 9th. As well as reviewing the nascent literature, the **purpose** of this article is to examine if the 9th P should be added to the mix. It also seeks to analyse the inherent implications and highlights the justifications for its inclusion or otherwise. The article adopted a reviewing of relevant literature approach as a **methodology**, back-up with pilot qualitative and quantitative studies. Drawing heavily from literature evidence and the pilot data outcome, this paper uses descriptive analysis to isolate the variable 9th mix elements. This article re-in forces the proposition and **argues** for the 9th P to be added, as well as **suggesting** what roles the 9thP variables would play in advancing the benefits for marketing, more broadly, whilst the **finding** revealed the addition would significantly enhance the chances of facilitating quality of marketing in this 21st century digital age. Importantly, this finding highlights an important shift in paradigm with respect to the 4-9 P's discourse.

Key words: Marketing mix; fundamentals of marketing; 4-7Ps and 4-9Ps; Internet Platform, Digital Marketing; Global marketing; Paradigm shift

I. INTRODUCTION

To put it in a context, this paper is about promoting the insight that the platform of the internet (digital marketing or digital up-skilling). It seeks to conceptualise and sensitise the role of the platform of the internet in a 21st century digitalised modern marketing environment. In the context of marketing, this article highlights the value of the changes, which are long overdue, but necessary and relevant to the increasingly advancing competitive digitalise world. That has inevitably overtaken nearly all aspect of our day-to-day living, which is beyond human control. Marketing mix, essentially, is the fundamentals of marketing, that dominates business activities in terms of business strategizing, which until recently consists only of the 4-7P's. Over time, the mix had evolved significantly in a way unimagined. This was, made more so, with the advent of the platform of the internet, which has brought these dramatic changes in the way businesses are being run.

This paper is being arranged as follows. Under the literature column below, this article endeavours to describe, highlight and analyse the developments surrounding the 4-9Ps phenomenon. Under the methodology a table has been constructed, which describes the changes in relation to each mix element. Ultimately, a determination had to be made as to whether the 9th P be justifiably added or not to the mix elements, as this papers seeks to achieve. In fact, it would be up to the readers/respondents to determine that, whilst the role of this paper is to do the relevant analysis based on the data that has been gathered.

1.1 Research problem /gap

Research problem is driven by the assumption given the perceived dominance of the digital platform(platform of the internet) amongst citizens and businesses around the globe, a scholarly discourse and more awareness on the subject of the platform of the internet (digital platform) would bring and make a meaningful impact in peoples' lives. This would benefit not only people on an individual career advancement need levels. It might also bring about competitiveness more broadly, for organisations and nations. Increase in the skills and knowledge of the digital marketing, the Platform, would lead to more benefit than detriment in terms of competitiveness. Although the 4-7th Ps of the elements of the marketing mix have long evolved (Borden,1948, 1949; McCarthy,1961, Bitner, 1981), however, their adaptability, usefulness and relevance have been seriously challenged in the 21st century environment. While the case of the 9th P (Platform of the

Internet) has not yet been made. If it has, then, its inclusion is relatively unnoticed or under-publicised. Thus, this paper is imperative.

1.2 Research question

1. In what ways the inclusion of the 9th Ps to the current 4-7 marketing mix elements framework, impact on the effectiveness of marketing in the 21st century? and
2. What are the possible implications for social marketing?

1.4 Research objectives

1. To critically review and analyse the literature relating of the Fundamental of marketing and identify the elements relating to the 9th Ps and argue for these to be added to the marketing mix elements framework.
2. To critically examine and analyse the role of the 9th P (Platform of the and its implication for social marketing

II. Review of Related Literature

As already stated above, marketing mix is the fundamentals of marketing, which presently consists of 7Ps, having expanded from 4Ps. This sets out the theoretical framework that underpins this paper. Below, the related literature development is, accordingly, in progress.

2.1 4Ps: Product, Price, Place & Promotion

As already stated, over time, the mix had evolved from the 4Ps relating to goods. It was initially suggested and developed by Borden(1949) but first used or formalised by McCarthy(1961). The key variable elements that compose this original 4Ps include product, Price, Place and Promotion. Subsequently, three more variables were added in relation to services, to become 7P's in Booms and Bitner(1981). The main variables that compose this 3 additional Ps are: People, Process and Physical evidence. Booms and Bitner(1981) were influenced by the value of humanity: humans are people that sustains the whole marketing or business process. After all marketing is a phenomenon that is being developed by responding to needs and or changes, which makes marketing so relevant and needed on a daily basis by almost every sphere of life.

The **Criticism** against the **4 Ps mix framework** is that not all of the elements could withstand the test of times in relation to the marketing needs of products over time or at different points in time. For instance, when 4Ps (product, price, promotion, place) were introduced, it was purposively meant for addressing the marketing needs of only goods, not services per se, which gave the impetus for the 5-7 Ps (process, people and physical evidence).

2.2 The 5-7 Ps: People, Process and Physical evidence

2.2.1 People

There is no way a business could operate without **People**. Be it the customer (consumption) or the producers (or offerings) middlemen (channels and physical experiences). So, importantly the human element was ever crucial; having been motivated by crucial role that humans play in every dimensions of marketing. This same reasoning is also behind the phenomenon of inseparability: it is almost impossible to distant the provider of a service from the service itself. This inseparable dual personality of service and the provider becomes all the more contentious with respect to the **People** variable within the marketing mix (Eguruze, 1996; Palmers, 2004;Kotler, 2012).

2.2.2 Process

Similarly, as with people, the **Process** phenomenon is equally vital. The process refers to the way in which a particular service is delivered. So, the delivery processes or methodology becomes all the more important. In fact, in clarifying further the process variable, Chaffey and Smith (2017) added the linkages between **Process and people**. They argued "if you're introducing a new approach, a new process, a system or even a new way of thinking, this can be strategic, eg. Introducing to measure, understand and drive all future decisions, nurturing 'Constant Beta Culture' or introducing a new customer service process integrating telephone, Twitter and Facebook"(Chaffey and Smith, 2017). In fact, this highlights the fact - quality standards should not be compromised between and/or among different experiences. That means there is need to standardise process, so as to help sustain such integrity of service or process. This may mean accessing criteria, measurement criteria, etc. It may become necessary in the planning; that means capacity building or quality standards training may be absolutely necessary.

2.2.3 Physical Evidence

The aspect of **Physical evidence** reminds us of the fact of intangibility of the services. Since service is intangible, it is sometimes cumbersome to quantify. Which is why it becomes necessary to embed into it some physical aspect as to evidence or impact the experience, in such a way that a service becomes feelable(experienced): provision of evidence of purchase, interior design/decoration, special lights effects,

special nature of the brand log or the building or premises., etc all geared towards creating a positive memorable purchasing experience or some form of negative dissonance after a purchase of a service. Increasingly, a more globalised, 21st century, dynamic and technology based business environment has made it now necessary to consider adding the 8th and the 9th P mix element, which is the Platform of the internet.

Criticism surrounding the 4-7Ps, as with the 4Ps, is that the originally marketing progamraame was no longer suitable for services marketing. That was the problem: a marketing miss-match or conflict between good and services marketing needs. Accordingly, again, as with the advent of time changes, as opposed to goods, there came along different marketing needs and so also the need to change strategy to cope with those changing need. Again, times and circumstances have changed. The marketing strategies that were meant for coping with services, apparently no longer appropriate, with the advent of the internet. So, the phenomena of the partnership and platform were necessary.

2.2.4 Partnerships (8th P)

But before engaging in full analysis of the Platform and its characteristics inherent therein, it must be noted that a 8th P (**Partnership**) apparently already has been introduced by other scholars (Smith, 2015;Chaffy and Smith,2017). To them, Partnership should the 8th P, to which the author now agrees, having analysed its component parts. The main reason being, their authorities, quite simply had preceded the value of this current research finding efforts. The lesson to learn is that before a scholar sets out to undertake a research on a particular phenomenon, its newness (or research gap) must be thoroughly analysed and researched, which is what occurred in this instance. In presenting and analysing their 8thP **element, Partnership**, Chaffey and Smith(2017) argues “introducing, strengthen or reducing strategic partnerships/marketing marriages/marketing alliances – can be strategic. They asked the crucial question - Are there potential partners out there whose customers would welcome your organisation’s product or services? Selecting the right partner can firstly give you access to a much bigger target market and secondly, strengthen your brand. But remember partnerships have to benefit both parties, with, clear goals, roles and responsibilities.” From their perspective it is strategic to include partnership in the mix variables. The core elements of partnership include: mergers and acquisitions, joint venture, agency, franchising, social networking, collaborating, working together and sharing together, achieving together, partnership marriages, co-branding, affiliations, interconnectivity, influencers, etc. In fact anything that two or more individuals act together with view to creating some form of collective impact in the quality of life of people, communities and society at large, may be deemed partnership. According to Smith (2016a) the mix also constitutes “intermediaries, affiliates, influencers, marketing marriages, strategic alliances, link partners”.

Crucially, anything that helps to making that business processes more mutually rewarding or might lead you to enjoy some leverages over your competitors. As the authors summarised – Partnership is all about “introducing, strengthening or reducing strategic partnerships or strategic alliances – (and) can be strategic” The asked “ Are there potential partners out there whose customers would welcome your organisation’s product or services?” Furthermore, they added “selecting the right partner can firstly give you access to a much bigger target market and secondly strengthen your brand.” And reminded us to “remember partnerships have to beneficial or has provide mutual values to the both partners, or: benefit both parties, with clear goals and responsibilities” (Chaffey and Smith, 2015, 2017; Smith 2016a). The work by Chaffey and Smith has had significant positive impact on the development of the fundamentals of marketing such as the marketing mix variable. And there is very close linkage with elements that constitutes the Platform (the P element of the marketing mix), as seen below.

However, there seem to be a **basic issue** with the partnership mix elements. The problem is that these variables are more related to highlighting methods of market entry or market entry strategies or expansion strategies, which are particularly related to the emergency of the platform of the internet or necessarily arising from the developments of the internet.

2.2.6 Platform (9th P) (Platform of the Internet)/(Digital marketing)

Reverting to **the Platform**, as previously stated, with the increase in globalisation, the 21st century dynamic and technology based business environment has made it now necessary to consider adding the 8th P mix element, which is the **Platform of the internet**. Platform of the internet is also “**Digital marketing**, “Digital marketing (formerly called e-marketing or internet marketing) – is at the heart of digital business’ Chaffey and Smith, 2017) and also (Swabi, 2013; Dominci, 2009; Chaffey and Ellis-Chadwick, 2012). It involves ‘getting closer to customers and understanding them better, adding value to products, widening distribution channels and boosting sales through digital marketing campaigns using digital media channels such as search marketing, online marketing and affiliate marketing, etc’. ‘It also includes using the website to facilitate customer leads, sales and managing after-services. As with mainstream marketing, digital marketing is a way of putting the customer at the heart of all online activities eg getting different user groups to test your website on different browsers in different settings on different connections’(Chaffey and Smith, 2017). Alternatively put, ‘digital marketing (seen as e-commerce or internet marketing – ‘generally refers to as paid-

for-transaction, whether B2C or B2B, but some commentators include all communications between customers and business'(Chaffey and Smith, 2017). But 'Digital business is broader, including e-commerce, and is a means to optimise all business processes that are part of the internal and external value chain.'(Chaffey and Smith, 2017). Importantly, 'Digital marketing is best considered as how digital tools such as websites, CRM systems, databases can be used to get closer to customers – to be able to identify, anticipate and satisfy their needs efficiently and effectively (Chaffey and Smith, 2017). In relation the Platform of the internet, these scholars outlined the five objectives of Digital Marketing or the five benefits of digital marketing: to grow sales, Add value, Get closer to customers, Save costs and extend the brand(Chaffey and Smith, 2017; Swabi, 2013; Dominci, 2009; Chaffey and Ellis-Chadwick, 2012)

The platform of the internet as an important marketing tool, arose from the advent of the phenomena of digital marketing, which is predominantly about BRANDING. Alternatively, it is about Virtual Brand (VB) and the Virtual Brand Community (VBC). With the introduction of the Platform, it is argued the phenomenon of Virtual Brand Community could be added, which automatically enlarges the 4-8Ps now to 9th in total. Scholars have defined "specifically, a virtual brand community is a group of people who share the same interest in a particular brand or product" (Casaló, Favián and Guinalú 2008). So, unlike other marketing mix elements, the Platform, the VBC, is variable without any physical boundaries or barriers. With the platform there is the increased risk of fraudulent activities: VBCs depend on individual users' participation, both group unity and awareness can strengthen users' satisfaction with a VBC. So, a safe and enjoyable risk free VBC is paramount.

The **criticism against the platform** is that it is a relatively new and niche area with limited of few players but huge interest and curiosity over this. However, it has a huge potential to develop over time, as technology advances further and further, which is why it is most interesting and attractive phenomenon. In spite of all these limitations, platform of internet is the way forward, as it is overwhelming controlling everything we do in this 21st century.

Justification for the 9th P to be added.

The justification for this as follows: it offers a unique distinct platform for marketing of brands, which is a fundamental aspect of digital marketing. Through the use a digital marketing platform (platform mix or VBC or (Virtual Brands Communities) organisations advance their various on line activities. "VBC can be described as aggregations of consumers that occur on the internet because of their interest in some brand or product" (Muniz and O'Guinn as cited in Georgi and Mink 2012, 3). Alternatively, VBC's are "the site[s] of complex brand meaning creation and consumption efforts" (Muñiz and Jensen Schau, 2007). It is added when a member is trusting of the VBC that they are part of, it increases their amount of participation, and consumers who have a **positive participation experience** are more loyal to the brand (Casaló, Favián and Guinalú (2008). **Trust** is a central aspect to guarantee the VBC's survival. Trust factor, is crucial during conversations between on line users(on line consumers). According to Cha (2009), that security is a major factor affecting a consumer's opinions toward social networking sites and can ultimately impact trust. Since VBCs depend on individual users' participation, both group unity and awareness can strengthen users' satisfaction with a VBC (Casaló, Favián and Guinalú 2008). Similarly, the study carried by Casaló, et al.,(2008) demonstrated the powerful influence VBC had on online interaction between consumers can have on their buying behaviour.

The CIM itself sees the Platform as " the process responsible for identifying, anticipating and satisfying customer requirements profitably"(CIM, accessed 04/06/19 The Platform mix could consist of: website location, periodic reviews of the brand contents, stimulating advertising, building trust(trust is vital part of the experience relating to the platform), as trust may lead to customer loyalty, positive participation experience, negative participation experience (eg risk to fraudulent or scam or hackers, etc), attracting recommendations, checking track records, what need – identity, ensuring consistency/competitiveness (to be more competitive), ensuring shop windows – listing consistently, building strong perception is vital to ensuring online portfolio. So, the platform is also about getting the planning processes right.

The Platform is a unique addition to the fundamental of marketing, in a way never experienced by marketers until recently. In fact, this has brought about a paradigm shift in the way in which marketing is being conducted or experienced. Thus, platform has been described as the VBC. A main topic being studied involving social media as a marketing tool is VBC. So, it should be embedded in to the mix.

III. METHODOLOGY

Below there we constructed a table constructed, purposely for this paper. This is for ease in understanding the subject for analytical purposes. The paper adopted a reviewing of relevant literature approach; while drawing heavily from same (literature evidence). We used descriptive analysis to isolate the variables with respect to the 4-9 P mix elements, as seen in the table (1) below.

Table 1: A table highlighting contrasts among the 4-9's by description of the key marketing mix elements and their characterisations

4-9Ps Marketing Mix Elements	Description of key elements & characterizations
1st P Product	In fact, a product may take the several forms and shapes and colours. All inclusive phenomenon, which encompasses whatever businesses/you offer to the whole wide world for sale: represented by several elements: design, quality of technology, branding, good or services, availability, features, colour, package, warranties, guarantees, investments, tangible and/or intangible, PLC,ROI, etc In this context all Borden(1949); McCarthy(1961); Kotler (2012); (Palmer, 2004).
2nd P Price	Going price, discounts, debts/bad debts, write off, mark up, loss, profit, gross profit, net profit, differentiation, cyber frauds/scams, fraudulent payments, list price, discounts, allowances, payment method, credit terms(30 days trial), payments(trial and returns), with service (attendants costs/tips) labour costs, overheads, raw material costs, warranties, guarantees, cannot be patented, etc Borden(1949); McCarthy(1961); Kotler (2012); (Palmer, 2004).
3rd P Place	Locations (situation), ease of access, delivery modes (intermediaries, channels of trade eg road(motorways, railways, waterways, airways, sub-marines, pipelines(oil/gas,water); coverage, assortments, locations, transportation, logistics, digital marketing(e-commerce/online marketing or internet business), geographic, territorial, specific locations - street markets, stock markets, fruit markets, bargain markets, boutiques, fried-plantain market, restaurants, retail shops, offices, etc Borden(1949); McCarthy(1961) ; Kotler (2012);(Palmer, 2004)
4th P Promotion	Advertising, personnel selling (face-to-face), sales promotion, public relation, direct marketing (direct mailing), publicity, corporate identity, form of promotion, business-to-business(industrial marketing), consumer marketing(business to consumer), merchandising, exhibitions, demonstrations, window displays, etc, mainly paid-for forms; non-paid for forms, PR, Publicity, etc Borden(1949); McCarthy(1961); Kotler (2012);(Palmer, 2004)..
5th P Process	The process design, the specific procedures, the unique experience, operationalisation, blueprinting approach, interior design, decorations, reception areas design, customer experiences, customer delight, organizational core service support, standardizations, measurements, CRM systems, etc (Booms and Bitner, 1981; Eguruze (1996); Kotler (2012); Palmer (2004).
6th P People	Personality, Business culture, staff recruitment, staff training, staff development, assessment, involvement, control support, trust/participation, delivery process, appraisals systems, etc (Booms and Bitner, 1981); Eguruze, (1996); Kotler (2012);(Palmer, 2004)..
7th P Physical Evidence	Buildings, proof of purchases (receipts or tickets), appearances/uniforms, the unique experience; elaborateness of interior design; elaborateness of decorations; elaborateness of reception areas design; customer experiences; image; customer delight; organizational core service support; colour decorations & lightings eg, brightness, dark, red, white, etc (Booms and Bitner(1981); Eguruze(1996); Kotler (2012); (Palmer, 2004).
8th P Partnership	Concepts and various marketing relationships (partnership marriages) such as mergers and acquisitions, joint venture, agency, franchising, social networking, collaborating, working together and sharing together, achieving together, co-branding, affiliations, interconnectivity, influencers, gate keepers, subsidiary, strategic alliances, etc. Chaffey and Smith(2015, 2017); Smith(2016 a&b); Kotler (2012).

<p>9th P Platform (of the internet)</p>	<p>Variety of concepts from digital marketing: website (Location – as with land – securing prime and/or subprime positions is key to this), digital media(all aps); branding (the phenomena of Virtual Brand (VB) and the Virtual Brand Community (VBC), community; databases, search, conversation, trust/participation; reviews/copy text; content, social media utilizing ads and contents via (pay per click(PPC), display ads, search engine optimizations(SEO), etc; social media marketing, filtering(bias), e-commerce, online marketing, the various forms of electronic payments (EP) – these include electronic funds transfer (EFT); electronic banking; (EB); mobile banking(MB); electronic data interchange (EDI); telephone banking (TB), cyber frauds/scams, etc. There are not exhaustive list.(Chaffey & Smith, 2015; 2017); Smith, 2016a & b; Suabi (2013); Kotler (2012).</p>
---	--

Source: Authors' construction 2019

Above in Table 1, the authors constructed table 1 to highlight the key contrasts among the 4-9 Ps by describing the key marketing mix elements and their characterisations. This would have enabled readers to find a rather complex detailed analysis of the 4th to 9th Ps marketing mix variables made easier and simpler to understand. Again, please the 4-9Ps are listed not in any particular order, merely for convenience for the purpose of analysis.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

4.1 Discussions

As seen above, in this paper, the 4-9Ps are analysed below. Scholars may add more elements as they see fit. At least this offered a starting point for researchers, learners and scholars. The 4-9Ps are discussed in more details below.

Of all the 4-9 mix elements, **Product** is the key to this. Product basically means good and services. These terminologies are used interchangeably. In fact, a product may take the several forms and shapes and colours. It is represented by several elements: design, quality of technology, branding, good or services, and availability, etc. All other elements are focused around the product. They include Price, Place (another term for place is physical distribution), Promotion, Process, People, Physical Evidence, Partnerships and Platform. The changing nature of product character is evident. The ability to adopt to change is critical in a fast changing technological driven marketing digital world (Chaffey, 2012, 2015, 2016, and Chaffey and Smith, 2017).

Criticism

As previously stated, in spite of all the benefits by we identified a few challenges relating to the developments of marketing mix framework. The main criticism against the marketing mix framework may that: it could nor service the entirety of times. As times and needs change over time, so also the role and usefulness or relevance of the mix elements also do change. The value of 4-7Ps was not defective. Rather the problem was it was originally introduced to service products that are goods, not services. Which means the 4-7Ps were traditionally meant to withstand or address or fulfil the marketing challenges relating to goods, not applicable to services marketing. But over time, with the emergence of services marketing and its associated challenges, came the 4-7Ps. These elements were purposively introduced to cater for the marketing needs of services, as opposed to goods. Thereafter, and most recently, the 9th P, came along, following the development of digital marketing platform, that is, the internet. As seen above, the ability to follow the changes is critical, in accordance with the technological evolution. The awareness of these issues is fundamental in this.

V. INTERPRETATIONS

5.1 Research limitations/implications

Digital marketing in fact, is a relatively new field in research as a subject compared to mainstream marketing. As such, it has relatively less research studies on it. This calls for the need to do more with respect to research effort in this niche aspect of marketing, which is increasingly becoming the future trendy demand area in marketing. At the same time, it is equally one of the fastest growing areas of marketing that any serious 21st marketing player should afford to ignore. Technological advancement is already known to be an external factor or threat to many in the business environment, and this

This paper therefore was constraint by certain limitations. The research only relate to the purpose of this article: to examine if the 9th Ps model be added to the mix. Marketing mix is the fundamentals of marketing, which presently consists of 7P's. As the study is limited to the 4-9Ps within the mix, we did not attempt to go beyond this. This implies that there is a great potential and scope for further research.

5.2 Practical implications

This research equally highlighted some practical implication for policy makers. One of which is that, from a digital marketing policy perspective, there should be a greater emphasis/reflection on meeting the digital skills needs of people at individual levels, as well as societal level. This need is not peculiar to one country. In fact, it is a global need – digital marketing. Similarly, there should be a digital gap analysis: “according to the (experts) PriceWaterhouseCoopers predicts that 44% of workers with low (digital marketing) education are at risk of their jobs being automated by the mid-2030s” (with respect to the UK, ”(Klimaki, 2019:4). Which means that, crucially, a lack of understanding of the platform language in particular, and digital marketing in general, would lead to loss of competitiveness or may exacerbate reductions in competitiveness, for countries that are less digital friendly.

5.3 Value and benefits

Importantly, this paper may result in enhanced awareness in certain values such as competitive edge. Which means that adding the 9th Ps would significantly increase or enhance the quality of digital marketing (e-commerce or online marketing, capabilities in a 21st century highly competitive digitalised world. It is important that “a continuous digital education is vital both for individual workers needing to see improvements in their personal employability or employable skills and opportunities, but also for advances in the economy as a whole, arising from digital competency. Additionally, for employees who are conscious of career development, it is critical to take a lead in developing a digital upskilling programme that reflects 21st century changing workplace demands. According to recruitment and specialists (Klimaki, 2019:4), understanding digital skill should be seen as a specialist and critical, not a basic skill, and could lead to gaining competitive edge over competitors. Furthermore, it is argued that staying up-to-date with technology is crucial in relation to career development, individually as a citizen and collectively as a country in an increasingly digitalised competitive world (Klimaki, 2019:4).

5.4 Originality

This is a conceptual and literature development paper and the authors endeavoured to formulate a table (Table 1) linking previous 4-7P's to the 9th Ps, and highlighted their impact on digital marketing in an increasingly more sophisticated 21st century competitive world. In that sense, it made some addition to the marketing mix, which is so fundamental in the 21st century marketing environment.

5.5 Benefits & implications

The paper highlights the numerous benefits associated with understanding application of digital marketing (the Platform of the internet). It is about the need to change with time, adaptations and learning positively, being open mindedness and inclusiveness. Ability to work collaboratively with partners or others, enjoying possible synergies that might come along with these possibilities

It is about realizing to catching on and catching up with new opportunities; new technologies make new things possible, new innovations and new creations which might lead to a whole new ways of thinking and living that be helpful and useful to the future challenges. Like technological entrepreneurs that might be able to explore and discover new things and new ways that are previously unthinkable or thought impossible.

More so, we would benefit from the speed, fastness and possible reliability and therefore reductions in costs in relation to productivity and more economic growth, etc

5.6 Implications for social marketing

Social marketing is about creating values, opportunities for all. It is force for good causes. It is seen as a provider of positive social change, thus generally perceived as a change agent in society and it stands for the good of the population at large. In that context, as the name suggests, it stands for the people's values, concerns and promotes quality of life, welfare and wellbeing of the people and society. It highlights and promotes good causes. Which is why in re-visiting the evolution of social marketing it could be recalled that learning its roots, its humble beginning was driven by the public or people's concern? The pioneering scholars of social marketing defined as “an approach to planned social change” or “a designed implementation and control of programmes calculated to influence the acceptability of social ideas and involving considerations of product planning, communications and marketing research” (Kotler and Zaltman, 1971:3-12). This definition came about in direct response to the very basic but critical question in which Wiebe asked, Zaltman, why can't we market brotherhood, as we do to soaps? (Wiebe, 1951). Which means there was a concern for change and the churches were exploring their desire for change by utilizing commercial or traditional marketing concepts, techniques and methods in marketing brotherhood? This suggests churches were inadequately marketed prior to the intervention of social marketing.

So, this singular action was there to radicalize the way in which marketing was used to effect social change in running churches and other non-profit making, non-commercial, and non-governmental organizations (Eguruze, 1996), as well as in marketing public sector and/or governmental services, social marketing is relevant and useful (Walsh, 1994) and even service marketing (Palmer, 2004). The parallel to this paper in relation to the call for Platform of the internet to be added or included, shares some similarity. Today many of the modern churches are employing social marketing techniques. To this end, Nigerian economic institutions should endeavour to ensure that they achieve positive social change by responding towards satisfaction of human needs or the needs of the citizens, which is a fundamental social responsibility they have over the citizens, but which they are largely currently failing to achieve in Nigeria (Gough, 1994; Andreassen, 1995, 2002, 2006; Smith, 1776, Keynes, 1934, Schumpeter, 1934; Crane and Matten, 2016).

In relation to this paper, similarly, the most vulnerable segments of society: those disadvantaged citizens, including young people and community organizations, are seeking policy makers to ensure national revenues to be spent judiciously as possible and promote digital marketing opportunities for all. In fact, developing young people's capabilities and community organisations' well being should be a social priority (Sen, 1993; Gough, 1994) and more so, it should be seen as a critical part of the wealth of the nation (Smith, 1776). So, in same way, young people and community organizations those are part of the vulnerable segments of society with less or no power and wealth and authority, seeking employment opportunities through improvement in digital skills, so as to enhance their employability. Policy makers do not have to over step or ignore the fundamental human right of young people and community organizations to exercise their superiority in terms of power authority and wealth to deny, deprive young people and community organizations from employment opportunities or opportunities to make progress on policy making and economic development (UDHR, 1948; African Charter, 1981; UNCRC, 1999, 2014; ICESCR 1996). A good part of leadership should be about pragmatism and being humane, acting for and on behalf of the people, not against the needs of the people. It would be humane to create jobs for young people and the communities. To do this will be a win for all in the society. The most important social obligation as leaders and policymakers is secure and safe future and welfare and well being of the future generation leadership. Social marketing calls for effective change of policy making, attitudinal and behavioural changes that move towards problem solving, solution providing and ultimately satisfying needs and wants of the people, including young people and community organizations, from a strategic social marketing perspective (French and Ross, 2015; Eguruze, 2016, 2017, 2019).

The authors also highlighted how useful and helpful with the application of digital marketing tool into handicraft marketing. The Platform of the Internet had helped to transform the marketing methods of paitker painting by rural women and indigenous people in the Jharkhand region of India. It is important to note therefore that, one of the fundamentally critical ways of creating value within disadvantaged rural communities is by adopting the digital application through the framework of social entrepreneurship (SEs), which contains the most significant roles of SEs: social leadership, influencing policy making, motivating/inspiring rural women and indigenous people to help themselves, creating local employment, and building (strategic) networks and collaborative working together, amongst others (Kumari, 2017). We learnt how digital application actually helped linked target markets to their handicraft products through on line connectivity.

VI. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In this paper, the marketing mix elements were discussed. It was argued the 9th Ps be added to the mix, as it would make more meaningful effort in a 21st century marketing environment – with respect to digital marketing.

So, also, the problems associated with gradual expansion of the marketing mix framework were briefly highlighted. Interplay of time, difference characteristics relating good and services, as well as other environmental factors, over time was a critical determining factor in all of these.

As with (Bitner (1991), Booms and Bitner (1981) and Gronroos (1994), this was seen as a **shift in paradigm with respect to the digital marketing and marketing mix composition**. Which means that the mix elements that needed to be put in consideration in any digital marketing programme is no longer the original 4-7th Ps, instead the 4-9th Ps would be more applicable with respect to the new marketing environment.

Most importantly, all the 4-9thPs are all individually and collectively unique and relevant at one point in time or another.

As recommendations, the paper therefore **suggest** as follows (i) The role of the 9th P should be embedded into any marketing programmes, as a vital digital tool. (ii) Ensure citizens are encouraged to take advantage of the shifts in paradigm with respect to gaining digital marketing knowledge, which is crucial in this 21st century competitive work environment. (iii) The lack of understanding of digital marketing skills would lead to loss in competitiveness not only individually but collectively as a country. (iv) In fact, investing in digital knowledge should be encouraged, as it would be helpful in terms of filling the digital skill gap. (iv) The addition

or inclusion of digital marketing would significantly enhance the chances of facilitating quality of marketing in this 21st century digital age. (v) More importantly, this finding highlights a shift in paradigm with respect to the 4-9 Ps discourse, (vi) Crucially, a further research be embarked on digital marketing, as an extended empirical paper to this, as this was literature and conceptualisation paper. (viii) Global policy makers should realise that, in a 21st century competitive market place/work environment, “staying up-to-date with technology is crucial”(Klimaki, 2019:4). In fact, a basic specialists digital knowledge can give you that competitive edge (Klimaki, 20129; Porter, 2008,2011;Ricardo, 1817). (ix) Disadvantaged communities and institutions ought to endeavour to be themselves, try and original and learn to be creative and innovative, utilising grass roots resorces to its full potential rather being dependent or following other advantageous, countries or communities thereby enriching and empowering others communities already well off, at its own detriment in relation to resource management and desire to be self sufficient, using the competitive spirit (Porter, 2008, 2011; Ricardo, 1817). (x) Finally, there is need to keep up with technological changes and take advantage of the massive benefits that following it. Alternatively be prepared to adapt to the ongoing evolutionary changes around the globe, largely driven by technological advancements (Chaffey, 2012, 2015, 2016, and Chaffey and Smith, 2017).

REFERENCES

- [1]. African Charter(1981). The 1981 African Charter. Available from http://www.who.int/hhr/human-peoples_right_pdf. Accessed on 13/02/15
- [2]. Alagoa, E.J.(1999) The land and peoples of Bayelsa State; Central Niger Delta, Port Harcourt; Onyema Research Publications.
- [3]. Allison-Oguru, E.A.,K. Zuofa, K., and Berepubo, N.A.(1999) . On chapter 23 in the lands and peoples of Bayelsa, Central Agriculture, Niger Delta, E.J. Alagoa, Port Harcourt: Onyema Research Publications.
- [4]. Alkire, S. and Foster, J.(2007). Counting and multidimensional poverty measures OPHI working paper series Oxford poverty and human development initiative, Oxford. Available from <http://www.ophi.org.uk> Accessed on 13/02/15
- [5]. Amadi, L. Itah-Imoh, I., and Obomamu, E.F. (2016) oil: Niger Delta and The Making of Militia capitalists: a theoretical assessment . International Journal of Social Science and Human Research (IJSSHR) 4(1) Jan-March 172-184
- [6]. Andreansen, A(1995)Marketing social change: changing behaviours to promote health, social development, and the environment. San Francisco, C.A: Jossey-Bass
- [7]. Andreansen, A(2002) Marketing social marketing in the social change market place. Journal of Public policy and Marketing, 21(1), 3-13.
- [8]. Andreansen, A(2006) Social marketing in the 21st century. Thousand Oaks:Sage Publications, Inc.
- [9]. Andrew , C., and Matten, D.(2016) Business ethics. Managing corporate citizenship and sustainability in the age of globalization, fourth edition. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- [10]. Angalapu, D., and Bila, D (2018) Poverty and climate change in the Niger Delta 2013-2018.
- [11]. Anyanwu, J.C., Oyefusi, A., Oaikhenan, H. and Dimowo, F.A.(1997).The structure of o the Nigerian economy (1960-1997). Onitsha: Joanee Educational Publishers Ltd.
- [12]. Appah, E.,John,M.S. and Soreh, W.(2012). An analysis of microfinance and poverty reduction in Bayelsa State of Nigeria. Kuwait chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and m Management Review 1(7), 38-57.
- [13]. Berry, M. and Chaffey, D. (2006) Making the business case for the digital marketing investment. Smart Insight Members book Available at: www.smartinsights.com/guides/digital-marketing-strategy/marketing-thebusiness-case-forinvestment-in-digital-marketing/
- [14]. Bitner, M.J., "The Evolution of the Services Marketing Mix and its Relationship to Service Quality," in Service Quality: Multidisciplinary and Multinational Perspectives, Brown, S.W., Gummesson, E., Edvardson, B. and Gustavsson, B. (eds), Lexington, Canada, 1991, pp. 23-37.
- [15]. Bitner, M.J. (1992) Service scapes: the impact of physical surrounding on customers and employees, Journal of Marketing, 60(2), 56-71
- [16]. Booms, B. H.; Bitner, M. J. (1981). "Marketing Strategies and Organization Structures for Service Firms". Marketing of Services. American Marketing Association: 47–51.
- [17]. Boro, IJA (1982) The twelfth day revolution, edited by Tony Tebekaemi, Benin City: Idodo Umeh Publishers Chaffey, D., and Smith, P.R.(2008) E-marketing excellence, planning and optimising your digital marketing (3rd ed.) Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- [18]. Chaffey, D., Ellis-Chadwick, F(2012) Digital marketing: strategy, implementation of and practice (5th ed.). Harlow: Pearson Education.

- [19]. Chaffey,D.(2012).Website conversation and revenue model calculators. Smart Insights, January. Available at: www.smartinsights.com/guides/conversation-opimization-calculator/
- [20]. Chaffey, D. (2015) Website feedback tools review. Smart Insights blog post, 5 January Available at: www.smartinsights.com/guides/digital-marketing-software/website-feedback-tools-review/
- [21]. Chaffey, D. (2016) Managing digital marketing in 2016. Research report:best practices in integrating digital technology and marketing to fuel business growth. Smart Insights, June. Available at: www.smartinsights.com/guides/managing-digital-marketing-2015/
- [22]. Chaffey, D., and Smith, P.R.(2017) Digital marketing excellence planning, optimizing and integrating online marketing fifth edition. Smart Insight.
- [23]. Dominici, G.(2009) From marketing mix to e-marketing mix: a literature review, International Journal of Business and Management, 9(4), 17-24.
- [24]. Eguruze, E.S. (2016) "Tackling poverty" in Bayelsa State, Bloomington, IN: Author House
- [25]. Eguruze, E.S. (2017) "Strategy for Tackling Poverty in Nigeria." Bloomington, IN: Author House.
- [26]. Eguruze, E.S. (2014) Social marketing techniques: a tool for poverty reduction in Bayelsa State of Nigeria, Niger Delta Research Digest (NDRD), 8(1), 1-36.
- [27]. Eguruze, E.S. (2015) Social marketing techniques: a methodology framework for poverty intervention in Bayelsa State of Nigeria. Niger Delta Research Digest (NDRD), 9(2), 81- 139.
- [28]. Eguruze, S.E.(2016) Paradoxes and contradictions: barriers affecting poverty elimination processes in Bayelsa State of Nigeria, International Journal of Social Science and Economic Research (IJSSR1(11), 1864-1898.
- [29]. Eguruze, S.E.(2016) Social Marketing Techniques: infrastructural development tool for poverty elimination in Bayelsa State of Nigeria, Wilberforce Journal of the Social Sciences (WJSS), 1(2) September, 61-94.
- [30]. Eguruze, Bennison and Loyd(2017) SMT: a literature review on poverty and advocacy for a new definition cumulative poverty (ie in-cumulative support), International Journal of Physical and Social Sciences (IJPSS) 7(3) March, 1-23.
- [31]. Eguruze, S.E.(2019) Factors influencing politicians and government officials choice for corruption mitigating against quality of poverty elimination services: perspective from young people and NYSC members-community organization in Nigerian , using social marketing techniques, IJRSS 9(4), 298-328.
- [32]. Eguruze, E.E. and Peter, S.E.O (2019) Youth participation and empowerment in community development work, Journal of Youth & Community Development (JYCD), 1(1),(An Abstract), 3-3.
- [33]. Eguruze, E.S., Emeti, C.I., & Ogriki,T.(2019) Entrepreneurship: a tool for tackling poverty; perspective from young people and NYSC-members' community organisation, using social marketing techniques, Singaporean Journal of Business Economics and Management Studies (SJBEM) 7(1) (forthcoming).
- [34]. Eguruze , E.S (2019) An analysis of the most significant causes, experiences and solutions to poverty; perspectives from young people and NYSC members national-community organisations in Nigeria, using Social Marketing Technique (SMT).(NDRD), (forthcoming).
- [35]. Eguruze, E.S. (2015) Social marketing techniques: new paradigms on overcoming extreme poverty in Bayelsa State of Nigeria, In the Sudanese Diaspora/World Association of Sustainable Development (WASD), Sussex University, Brighton, UK, 11-12 June
- [36]. Eguruze, E.S. and Bennison M. (2014) The Strategy Conference: A Tool For Promoting Unity of View and Action(an Updated and Expanded Version). A Conference paper; Faculty of Management Sciences, Niger Delta University, Wilberforce Island, Bayelsa State, Nigeria, 6 May (unpublished)
- [37]. French, J. and Ross, G.(2015)"Strategic social marketing," SAGE Publications Inc.
- [38]. Gough, I (1994). Economic institutions and the satisfaction of human needs. Journal of Economics Issues. 28(1),25-66.
- [39]. Grönroos, C. (1994). "From marketing mix to relationship marketing: towards a paradigm shift in marketing." Management decision 32(2), 4-20.
- [40]. Klimaki, S.(2019) Digital dynamite: how upskilling can give your cv extra sparke. The Evening Standard, 7 November, p4.
- [41]. Klimaki, S.(2019) From office skills to specialist knowledge that gives you an edge - Sylvia Klimaki looks at the impact of strong digital skills on helping you stand out from the crowd. Digital dynamite: how upskilling can give your cv extra sparke. The Evening Standard, 7 November, p4.
- [42]. Klimaki, S.(2019) Digital skills In a competitive job market, staying up-to-date with technology is crucial. Here we speak to recruiters that will help you make your next career move. The Evening Standard, 7 November, p4.

- [43]. Kotler, P.(2000) Marketing management, (millennium edition), custom edition for University of Phoenix, Prentice Hall.
- [44]. Kotler, P.(2012). Marketing Management. Pearson Education.
- [45]. Kotler P.; and Zaltman, G. (1971) Social marketing: an approach to planned social change.
- [46]. The journal of marketing, American Marketing Association 33 (July), 3-12.
- [47]. Kumari, G(2017) "Revival of Pyatker painting through craft village:Study of Jharkhand".Journal of Rural and Industrial Development, 5(1) April, 58-64.
- [48]. McCarthy, J. E. (1964). Basic marketing. a managerial approach. Homewood, IL: Irwin
- [49]. McCarthy, J.E. (1975) Basic Marketing: A managerial approach, fifth edition, Richard, D. Irwin, Inc
- [50]. Mosop (1995). Movement of the survival of the Ogoni peoples; bill of rights Okoko, K.(2011) Crisis and development in the Niger Delta: selected works of Kimse Okoko (edited by Nna, J.N. and Ibaba, S.I, 2011). Port Harcourt: University of Port Harcourt.
- [51]. Osah, G., Oguniwa,A.O., and Eti, C.(2017) Conflict entrepreneurs, informal economies and structural reforms in the Niger Delta. Journal of International Policies and Development (JIPA) 15(1), 65-80
- [52]. Palmer, A(2004). Principles of service marketing (fifth ed.). London:The McGraw-Hill Companies
- [53]. Porter, M(2011) Competitive advantage of nations: creating and sustaining superior performance. Reprint . NY: Simon and Schster.
- [54]. Porter, M(2008) Michael Porter on competition updated and expanded version. A Havard Business Review. Boston,MA: Havard Business Press.
- [55]. Ricardo, D.(1817) Comparative advantages available from <http://www.google.co.uk>. Accessed on Thursday 24/01/13
- [56]. Sen,A.(1993), "Capabilities and Well being", in Nussbaum and Sen (eds.) The Quality of Life, Oxford: Clarendon Press
- [57]. Sibiri, E.A. (2013). Poverty and child abuse: a study of the child hawker in Yenagoa City (Bayelsa State) Niger Delta Research Digest 7(1),
- [58]. Smith, A. (1776). The wealth of nations Available from <http://www.google.co.uk>) Accessed Thursday 24/01/13
- [59]. Schumpeter, J. A. (1951). "Economic Theory and Entrepreneurial History," in R. V. Clemence, ed., Essays on Economic Topics of Joseph Schumpeter. Port Washington, NY: Kennikat Press.
- [60]. Schumpeter, J.A. (1943). Capitalism, socialism and democracy - 6th. ed. Counterpoint edition. London : Unwin Paperback
- [61]. Tamuno, N.T. (2011) Oil wars in the Niger Delta (1849-2009). Ibadan: Stirling- Horden Publishers (Nig.) Ltd.
- [62]. The World Bank(2012)"World Development Indicators Database" accessed on October 10, 2012: http://info.worldbank.org/etools/kam2/KAM_paper5.asp#c103
- [63]. Uddin, S.O. and Uddin, O.O(2013) Causes, Effects and Solutions to Youth Unemployment Problems in Nigeria. Journal of Emerging Trends in Economics and Management Sciences (JETEMS) 4(4), 397-402
- [64]. UDHR, (1948). Universal declaration of human rights (1948)- Article 25 available from <http://un.org/en/documents/udhr/> Accessed on 13/02/15
- [65]. UNCRC(1999;2014) Convention on the right of the Child, UNCRC, 1999)
- [66]. Walsh, K.(1994) "Marketing and public sector management", European Journal of Marketing, 28(3), 63-71
- [67]. Wiebe, G.D. (1951). Merchandising commodities and citizenship on television.
- [68]. Public Opinion Quarterly, Winter, 15(4), 679 -691

*Ebikinei Stanley Egoruze^{PhD}, Gaitri Kumari,^{PhD},
Mona Ratnesh,^{PhD}, Dr Benneth Nwafor,^{PhD}*